

Garrett V. Jensen, State Bar No. 242874
gjensen@cdfllaborlaw.com
CAROTHERS DISANTE & FREUDENBERGER LLP
2600 Michelson Drive, Suite 800
Irvine, California 92612
Telephone: (949) 622-1661
Facsimile: (949) 622-1669

David L. Terry, North Carolina State Bar No. 11113
dterry@poynerspruill.com
David L. Woodard, North Carolina State Bar No. 19343
dwoodard@poynerspruill.com
POYNER SPRUILL LLP
301 S. College Street, Suite 2300
Charlotte, North Carolina 28202
Telephone: (704) 342-5250
Facsimile: (704) 342-5264

Attorneys for Defendant
BEST BUY STORES, L.P. (erroneously sued as
Best Buy Co., Inc.)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

HESHAM HEBEISH, an individual,)	Case No. SACV15-401 DOC (ASx)
)	
Plaintiff,)	[Removed from Orange County
vs.)	Superior Court, Case No. 30-2014-
)	00762245-CU-WT-CJC]
BEST BUY CO., INC., a Minnesota)	
Corporation, and DOES 1 through 30,)	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
inclusive,)	ORDER
)	
Defendant.)	Trial Date: July 19, 2016

1 Subject to the approval of the Court, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED by and
2 between Plaintiff Hesham Hebeish (“Plaintiff”) and Defendant Best Buy Stores, LP
3 (erroneously sued as Best Buy Co., Inc.) (“Defendant”) (together referred to as the
4 “parties”) through their respective counsel, that a protective order be entered in this
5 action in accordance with the following terms:

6 **1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

7 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
8 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
9 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be
10 warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter
11 the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order
12 does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and
13 that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the
14 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the
15 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section
16 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file
17 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures
18 that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks
19 permission from the court to file material under seal.

20 **B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

21 Given the nature of the allegations made by Plaintiff and the anticipated
22 subjects of discovery in this action, various Discovery Material (defined below) and
23 related documents may contain confidential, private, proprietary, commercially
24 sensitive, trade secret or other personal business information regarding, among other
25 things, Defendant’s employees and operations. Various Discovery Material may also
26 disclose information that involves third party privacy rights. Such confidential,
27 proprietary and/or private information requires special protection from public
28 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action.

Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this Action.

Consequently, the parties agree to maintain the confidentiality of such Discovery Material in this action. Moreover, the parties are willing to forego a Motion for a Protective Order at this time by mutually agreeing as to the proper method to keep, secure, use and handle such Discovery Material. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: this pending federal law suit, Case No. SACV15-401 DOC (ASx)

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement, including but not limited to Discovery Material.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record for the parties and Defendant’s In-House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

1 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
2 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
3 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
4 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

5 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
6 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
7 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

8 2.8 In-House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of Defendant or an
9 entity related to Defendant. In-House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of
10 Record or any other outside counsel.

11 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
12 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

13 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
14 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
15 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
16 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

17 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
18 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
19 support staffs).

20 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material in this Action.

22 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
23 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
24 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
25 and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
27 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

28 ///

1 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
2 from a Producing Party.

3 **3. SCOPE**

4 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
5 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
6 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
7 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
8 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial
10 judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11 **4. DURATION**

12 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
13 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
14 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
15 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
16 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
17 exhaustion of all appeals, re-hearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
18 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
19 pursuant to applicable law.

20 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

21 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for
22 Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for
23 protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific
24 material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. If it comes to a Designating
25 Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not
26 qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties
27 that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

28 ///

1 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
2 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
3 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
4 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
5 produced.

6 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

7 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
8 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
9 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
10 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that
11 contains protected material.

12 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
13 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
14 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
15 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
16 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
17 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
18 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing
19 the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL
20 legend” to each page that contains Protected Material.

21 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
22 identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
23 deposition all protected testimony. Deposition testimony previously given, or
24 Disclosure or Discovery Material disclosed during a deposition prior to the entry of
25 this Order may be designated CONFIDENTIAL within twenty (20) days following
26 entry of this Order.

27 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
28 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place

1 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
2 legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
3 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
4 portion(s).

5 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
6 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
7 Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
8 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
9 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
10 Order.

11 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

12 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
13 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
14 Scheduling Order.

15 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
16 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

17 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
18 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
19 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
20 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived
21 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
22 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
23 Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

24 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

25 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
26 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
27 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
28 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the

1 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
2 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
3 DISPOSITION).

4 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
5 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
6 authorized under this Order.

7 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
8 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
9 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
10 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

11 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action,
12 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
13 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

14 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including In-House Counsel)
15 of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

16 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
17 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
18 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

19 (d) the court and its personnel;

20 (e) court reporters and their staff;

21 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
22 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and
23 who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

24 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information
25 or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

26 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in
27 the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing
28 party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2)

1 they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
 2 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
 3 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
 4 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be
 5 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as
 6 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

7 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting
 8 personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement
 9 discussions.

10 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**
 11 **PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

12 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
 13 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
 14 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

15 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such
 16 notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

17 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or
 18 order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
 19 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a
 20 copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

21 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
 22 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

23 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
 24 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
 25 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
 26 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
 27 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
 28 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions

1 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to
2 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

3 **9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
4 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

5 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by
6 a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
7 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
8 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
9 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

10 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request,
11 to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
12 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
13 confidential information, then the Party shall:

14 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the
15 Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
16 agreement with a Non-Party;

17 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the
18 Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a
19 reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

20 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by
21 the Non-Party, if requested.

22 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court
23 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving
24 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
25 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving
26 Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to
27 the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.

28 ///

Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to

1 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
2 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
3 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

4 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
5 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
6 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
7 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
8 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
9 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

10 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

11 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
12 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
13 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
14 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
15 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
16 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
17 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
18 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60-day deadline that (1) identifies
19 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
20 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
21 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
22 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
23 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
24 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
25 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
26 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
27 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
28 Section 4 (DURATION).

14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD:

Dated: December 1, 2015 CAROTHERS DISANTE & FREUDENBERGER
LLP

By: /s/Garrett V. Jensen
Garrett V. Jensen

Attorneys for Defendant
BEST BUY STORES, L.P. (erroneously sued as
Best Buy Co., Inc.)

Dated: December 1, 2015 POYNER SPRUILL LLP

By: /s/David L. Woodard
David L. Woodard

Attorneys for Defendant
BEST BUY STORES, L.P. (erroneously sued as
Best Buy Co., Inc.)

Dated: December 1, 2015 LAW OFFICE OF CATHERINE ANNE ALLEN

By: /s/Catherine Anne Allen
Attorneys for Plaintiff
HESHAM HEBEISH

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: December 3, 2015

/ s /
Honorable Alka Sagar
United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
 issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on
 [date] in the case of ***Hebeish v. Best Buy Co., Inc., Case No. SACV15-401 DOC***
(ASx). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated
 Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could
 expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly
 promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject
 to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance
 with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name]
 of _____ [print or type full address and telephone number]
 as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any
 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____